

en número, se volvió el foco de los miedos públicos, símbolo del crimen y la corrupción policíaca. El caso más sonado fue el de la “Banda del Automóvil Gris”, cuyo organizador, Higinio Granada, fue expulsado del país en 1921 bajo el argumento, entre otros, de sus antecedentes criminales (*ASRE* 9-4-179).

Si bien las nociones positivistas no desaparecieron, hubo un cambio de actitud de las élites en torno al castigo; se hablaba ya de las causas sociales de la criminalidad y de la “rehabilitación” de los criminales. Ello fue resultado, en gran medida, de la participación de distintos sectores en el debate sobre el tema, entre ellos los abogados y los propios prisioneros, a quienes el sentimiento de identidad, aunado a los cambios políticos y sociales del período, había conformado en una voz política.

Pablo Piccato busca romper con la tradición historiográfica que establece una dicotomía entre el antiguo régimen y la Revolución. Elige por ello un período —1900-1931— que rebasa esta “frontera”. Si bien el marco temporal está determinado por el cambio institucional —la inauguración de la penitenciaría federal en San Lázaro y el decreto de un nuevo *Código Penal*, respectivamente—, el libro sitúa el crimen frente a ideas y prácticas cotidianas mucho más estables de la población, que aún podemos identificar: la presencia de la policía no se asocia con mayor seguridad, sino con corrupción y mayor violencia; la gente prefiere evitar la intervención de los jueces en sus disputas, ya que el sistema judicial parece conservar los viejos prejuicios de clase y género.

Las conclusiones son claras: la frecuencia y el carácter de las ofensas no siempre responden favorablemente al incremento de la vigilancia y el castigo. Por el contrario, el crimen se convierte en un fenómeno más disruptivo para la mayoría de la población cuando el Estado aplica políticas sistematizadas en contra de los sospechosos. Lo interesante es que el autor no limita las observaciones al período que estudia, y nos muestra que en la actual lucha contra el narcotráfico, gobiernos como el de México y Estados Unidos, que parecen olvidar la experiencia histórica, corren el riesgo de cometer los mismos errores.

Paola Chenillo Alazraki

Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México

“Gender and Sexuality in Latin America,” A special issue of *Hispanic American Historical Review* 81: 3-4 (August-November 2001).

The *Hispanic American Historical Review*’s special issue on gender and sexuality is one of the most theoretically informed and methodologically diverse of any issue of the journal in recent memory. The editors are to be commended for putting together a collection of superb essays which truly represents the

diversity of this rapidly changing and expanding field of scholarship. There is a preliminary historiographical article, four articles on Chile, two on Mexico, and a final article on the historiography and intellectual history of Latin American homosexuality. Three articles are historiographical, two are institutional histories (one of a Chilean welfare agency and the other of a Mexican insane asylum), one is a political history of anarchist groups, another is a social/cultural history of Chilean agrarian laborers, and one more is a microhistory of a famous Mexican criminal case. All of the authors make excellent use of their sources, as they have been influenced by recent movements which seek to analyze gender encoded meanings in all history.

Sueann Caulfield shows that the field has developed significantly since initial calls for serious work on the history of women. In the 1970s academics influenced by labor, leftist, and feminist movements challenged the lack of scholarship on women and attempted to produce social and political histories which focused primarily on women. By the 1980s and 1990s, others challenged authors to discuss the broader analytical category of gender. These scholars produced influential works that focused on discourse and institutions, but often lost the earlier focus of the social historians on "history from below." By the mid-1990s, academics produced works with greater nuance that used theoretical approaches which incorporated both discourse from above and popular culture from below.

Thomas Miller Klubock shows that the Chilean historiography of gender was heavily influenced by the Allende government in Chile, and perhaps even more so by its violent overthrow in 1973. The involvement of some Chilean scholars in leftist movements, and the subsequent exile of many academics, influenced their works. Klubock also shows that gender history in Chile went through a series of changes, moving from a social historical focus on women to a more cultural focus on discourses and institutions of gender, to approaches (some influenced by poststructuralist and postcolonial frameworks) which engage in a greater combination of social and cultural history. Klubock concludes his overview with an intriguing suggestion that historians of gender in Chile need to engage in a greater analysis of issues such as "everyday practices of love, intimacy, and pleasure," and focus more on the relationship between labor and sexuality.

Elizabeth Quay Hutchison's analysis of the relationship between gender, sexual politics, and the anarchist movement in early twentieth-century Chile is based on a number of articles and pamphlets spanning three decades in the anarchist press. Anarchist writers and organizers first argued that women were "slaves" to capitalists, as they faced double oppression. This position later changed, as a series of anarchists argued that women had betrayed working class men because they opposed men both in the workplace and at home.

---

Although this second position never had universal acceptance within the anarchist press, it is significant that it received quite a bit of support. Women were used within this anarchist discourse as symbols for the successes and failures of the revolutionary movement.

Karin Alejandra Rosemblatt provides a gendered analysis of welfare policies in mid-twentieth-century Chile. As the state attempted to provide welfare benefits to workers, leftist organizers and workers were deeply suspicious of these provisions. Yet leftists later had great influence over the primary welfare organization, the Caja de Seguro Obligatorio (CSO). The CSO supported traditional familial relationships and conservative sexual politics. While the CSO provided welfare only for workers in the formal labor force, those in the informal labor force were criticized as effeminate, and the CSO failed to provide benefits for wives and other dependents of workers, relegating them to a secondary status. Rosemblatt's gendered analysis of a mainstream political institution shows the importance of using gender in all historical writing.

Heidi Tinsman reads criminal trials for their social and cultural content, analyzes memory in oral history, and discusses institutional texts for their approach to masculinity, femininity, and sexuality. Tinsman argues that the Chilean agrarian reforms of the late 1960s and early 1970s, while promoting an ideal masculinity in which men were responsible to their wives, also promoted an aggressive masculine rebel who participated in organizing workers. Tinsman sees the contradictions of the agrarian reform, particularly in its more revolutionary form during the Allende years. The reform disrupted traditional gendered labor relationships in which men worked on haciendas and women provided subsistence agriculture. Through agrarian reform, women's subsistence labor became increasingly irrelevant. Tinsman's most shocking conclusion (based on both oral histories and criminal documents), that spousal violence likely increased significantly during the Allende years, shows that many rural laborers viewed themselves as independent, masculine men who controlled their own destinies, and saw their wives and families as dependents. This self-vision and other structural issues led to a series of spousal confrontations, sometimes violent, over economic control and proper male sexual behavior.

Pablo Piccato uncovers a series of conflicting discourses and attitudes toward sexuality in his analysis of the case of "El Chalequero," Francisco Guerrero, who raped and killed prostitutes in the impoverished northern suburbs of Mexico City in the 1880s. Much of the community knew about Guerrero, but failed to report him because prostitutes and other women who were raped by him feared further humiliation from the police, believed that Guerrero was unlikely to be convicted, and realized that, when he was freed, they would likely be killed (Guerrero eventually was caught and convicted). When a woman accused a

man of rape, she was unlikely to be taken seriously, was subjected to gruesome and humiliating examinations at the police station, and her honor was further defiled through public humiliation. Piccato's approach shows that gender and sexuality connected with criminality, and that society largely accepted high levels of sexual violence in impoverished communities.

Cristina Rivera-Garza, in her analysis of the insane asylum in late Porfirian and early revolutionary Mexico, points to the conflicting narratives of elite male doctors and impoverished female patients to show the relationship between discourses of gender, sexuality, class, modernity, and insanity. Upon entrance into the asylum, female patients were asked a series of sexual questions. Some women, diagnosed as morally insane, tended to have "uncontrollable" sexual urges, as evidenced by promiscuous sex and prostitution. Many of these women also wrote their own narratives while still in the asylum. Interestingly, the women's narratives tended to accept their diagnoses, but attributed their insanity to controlling mothers, cheating husbands, sexual abuse, and broader societal issues.

Martin Nesvig concludes the volume with an overview of homosexuality in Latin America. Nesvig shows that far too little historical work has been done on the social history of homosexuality. Work on the colonial period of Spanish America has overwhelmingly focused on legal institutions. While the scholarship on colonial Brazil has focused more on society, some of this work has been tainted by the desire of certain scholars to maintain an "essentialist" position in which they confuse pederasts with self-identified modern homosexuals. For modern Latin America, most historical studies of homosexuality focus on literary, criminological and medical discourses. Many scholars have viewed the active/passive dichotomy, in which the active partner in homosexual activity (particularly in sodomy) is seen as the masculine (and "normal") penetrator and the passive partner is seen as the feminine penetrated, as the central organizing principle of male homosexuality in Latin America. However, Nesvig correctly argues that this overstates the case, for the active partner has not always escaped condemnation, and he has sometimes been punished more aggressively than the passive.

The diversity of approaches presented here shows that a gendered analysis may be accomplished using virtually any source for any period in history. Just as Hutchison discovers a discourse of gender in anarchist newspapers, Tinsman analyzes the role of masculinity in the historical memories of agrarian laborers, and Rivera-Garza finds gender and sexuality in the narratives of the supposedly insane.